UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
31761 06103129 0

RESTITUTION

2007 — 2008

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 30 2007

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

RESTITUTION

2007 — 2008

Professor E.J. Weinrib

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/restitution00wein_4

Restitution

I. THE NATURE OF RESTITUTION

Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, Book Five 1129a26 - 1132b20,
(Ostwald trans.) 1
Ernest J. Weinrib, Corrective Justice in a Nutshell, 52 U.T.L.J. 349 (2000) 6
Edwards v. Lee's Administrator, 96 S.W. (2d) 1028 (Ky. C.A., 1936) 13
Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co. (1910), 124 N.W. 222 (Minn. S.C.) 17
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937),
§ 122. Benefits Derived From the Exercise of Incomplete Privilege 20
Palmer, The Law of Restitution, Volume I, 139-140
(Boston and Toronto: Little, Brown, 1978) 22
Foskett v. McKeown [2003] 3 All ER 97 (HL) 23

II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF RESTITUTION

Moses v. MacFerlan (1760), 97 E.R. 676, 2 Burr. 1005 (K.B.) 35
Dobbs, Handbook on the Law of Remedies, (St. Paul: West, 1973) 229 37
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937) 51
Seavey and Scott, Restitution, (1938) 54 Law Quarterly Review 29,
29-32, 36-39 53
Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. and Constantineau, [1954] S.C.R. 725;
[1954] 3 D.L.R. 785 57
Pavey & Matthews Proprietary Ltd. v. Paul (1986) 162 C.L.R. 221
(H.C. Australia) 59
Pettkus v. Becker (1980), 117 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.) 64
Hunter Engineering Co. v. Syncruce Canada Ltd., [1989] 1 S.C.R. 426 72
Peter v. Beblow (1993), 101 D.L.R. (4th) 621 (S.C.C.) 80
Dublin v. Building and Allied Trade Union [1996] 2 ILRM 547 (S.C.) 93

III. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS

1. "One Cleans Another's Shoes ..."

Taylor v. Laird (1856), 156 E.R. 1203 100
Restatement of Restitution - s. 2 101
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 101-103 102
Greenwood v. Bennett, [1973] 1 Q.B. 195 (C.A.) 104
Nicholson v. St. Denis (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 315 (C.A.) 107
Gidney v. Shank [1995] 5 W.W.R. 385 (Man Q.B.) 111

Restitution

I. THE NATURE OF RESTITUTION

Aristotle, Nicomachean Ethics, Book Five 1129a26 - 1132b20,
(Ostwald trans.) 1
Ernest J. Weinrib, Corrective Justice in a Nutshell, 52 U.T.L.J. 349 (2000) 6
Edwards v. Lee's Administrator, 96 S.W. (2d) 1028 (Ky. C.A., 1936) 13
Vincent v. Lake Erie Transportation Co. (1910), 124 N.W. 222 (Minn. S.C.) 17
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937),
§ 122. Benefits Derived From the Exercise of Incomplete Privilege 20
Palmer, The Law of Restitution, Volume I, 139-140
(Boston and Toronto: Little, Brown, 1978) 22
Foskett v. McKeown [2003] 3 All ER 97 (HL) 23

II. THE DEVELOPMENT OF RESTITUTION

Moses v. MacFerlan (1760), 97 E.R. 676, 2 Burr. 1005 (K.B.) 35
Dobbs, Handbook on the Law of Remedies, (St. Paul: West, 1973) 229 37
Extract from American Restatement of Restitution (1937) 51
Seavey and Scott, Restitution, (1938) 54 Law Quarterly Review 29,
29-32, 36-39 53
Deglman v. Guaranty Trust Co. and Constantineau, [1954] S.C.R. 725;
[1954] 3 D.L.R. 785 57
Pavey & Matthews Proprietary Ltd. v. Paul (1986) 162 C.L.R. 221
(H.C. Australia) 59
Pettkus v. Becker (1980), 117 D.L.R. (3d) 257 (S.C.C.) 64
Hunter Engineering Co. v. Syncruce Canada Ltd., [1989] 1 S.C.R. 426 72
Peter v. Beblow (1993), 101 D.L.R. (4th) 621 (S.C.C.) 80
Dublin v. Building and Allied Trade Union [1996] 2 ILRM 547 (S.C.) 93

III. UNREQUESTED BENEFITS

1. "One Cleans Another's Shoes ..."

Taylor v. Laird (1856), 156 E.R. 1203 100
Restatement of Restitution - s. 2 101
Birks, An Introduction to the Law of Restitution (1985) 101-103 102
Greenwood v. Bennett, [1973] 1 Q.B. 195 (C.A.) 104
Nicholson v. St. Denis (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 315 (C.A.) 107
Gidney v. Shank [1995] 5 W.W.R. 385 (Man Q.B.) 111

Gidney v. Shank reversed [1996] 2 W.W.R. 383 (Man C.A.) 116
LAC Minerals Ltd. v. International Corona Resources Ltd. (1987), 44 D.L.R. (4th) 592 (Ont. C.A.); (1989) 61 D.L.R. (4th) 14 (S.C.C.) 118
The Electrical Appliances Case BUNDESGERICHTSHOF (SEVENTH CIVIL SENATE) 31 OCTOBER 1963* 124

2. Incidental Benefits

Ruabon Steamship Co. v. London Assurance, [1900] A.C. 6 (H.L.) 128
Edinburgh and District Tramways v. Courtenay [1909] S.C. 99 132
United States v. Pacific Railroad 7 S. Ct. 490 (1887) 134

3. Preserving Another's Property

Binstead v. Buck (1777), 2 Wm. Black. 1117 (C.P.) 135
Nicholson v. Chapman (1793) 126 E.R. 536 (C.P.) 136
Falcke v. Scottish Imperial Insurance Company (1886), 34 Ch. D. 234 138
Great Northern Railway v. Swaffield (1874) L.R. 9 Ex. 132 (Exch.) 143
Prager v. Blatspiel, Stamp and Heacock, [1924] 1 KB 566 (KBD) 146
Jebara v. Ottoman Bank, [1927] 2 KB 254 (C.A.) 148
China Pacific S.A. v. Food Corporation of India (The Winston), [1982] A.C. 939 (H.L.) 149
Restatement of Restitution - s. 117 153

4. Preserving Another's Health

Jenkins v. Tucker (1788) 126 ER 555 (C.P.) 155
Shallcross v. Wright (1850) 50 E.R. 1174 156
Matheson v. Smiley, [1932] 2 D.L.R. 787 (Man. C.A.) 158
Restatement of Restitution - s. 116 160

5. Discharging Another's Liability

Moule v. Garrett (1872), L.R. 7 Ex. 101 (Ex. Chamber) 162
Brooks Wharf & Bull Wharf, Ltd. v. Goodman Bros., [1936] 3 All E.R. 696 (C.A.) 164
Owen v. Tate, [1975] 2 All E.R. 129 (C.A.) 167
Norton v. Haggett (1952), 85 A. 2d 571 (Vt. S.C.) 173
Regional Municipality of Peel v. Her Majesty the Queen in right of Canada (1992), 98 D.L.R. (4th) 140 (S.C.C.) 175

---

* English version by Gerhard Dannemann, in Markesinis, Lorenz, Dannemann, The German Law of Obligations v. 1 (The Law of Contracts and Restitution: A Comparative Introduction 789 (1997).

IV. MISTAKEN PAYMENTS

1. The Irrelevance of Fault

Kelly v. Solari (1841), 9 M & W 54, 152 E.R. 24 188
Clark v. Eckroyd (1885), 12 O.A.R. 425 190
R.E. Jones v. Waring and Gillow, [1926] A.C. 670 (H.L.) 193

2. Change of Position

Rural Municipality of Storthoaks v. Mobil Oil Canada Ltd. (1975), 55 D.L.R. (3d) 1 (S.C.C.) 197
Lipkin Gorman v. Karpnale, [1992] 4 All E.R. 512 (H.L.) 199
Dextra Bank & Trust Co Ltd v Bank of Jamaica, 2002] 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC) 1 All ER (Comm) 193 (PC) 211
RBC Dominion Securities Inc. v. Dawson (1994), 111 D.L.R. (4th) 230 (Nfld. C.A.) 216
Cheese v. Thomas [1994] 1 All E.R. 35 (C.A., Civ. Div.) 225

3. Mistake of Law and Invalid Exactions

Garland v. Consumers' Gas Co., [2004] 1 S.C.R. 629 231
Kingstreet Investments Ltd. v. New Brunswick (Department of Finance) [2007] 1 S.C.R. 3 242

V. BENEFITS CONFERRED UNDER COMPULSION

Astley v. Reynolds (1731), 93 E.R. 939 K.B. 250
Skeate v. Beale (1841), 113 E.R. 688 251
Knutson v. The Bourkes Syndicate, [1941] S.C.R. 419 252
Peter Kiewit Sons' Co. of Canada v. Eakins Construction Ltd., [1960] S.C.R. 361 254
Morton Construction Co. Ltd. v. City of Hamilton, [1962] O.R. 154 (C.A.) 259
Smith v. William Charlick Ltd. (1924) 34 C.L.R. 38 (H.C.) 261
Pao On v. Lau Yiu, [1979] 3 All E.R. 65 (P.C.) 264
Universe Tankships Inc. of Monrovia v. International Transport Workers Federation, [1983] A.C. 366 (H.L.) 270
Thorne v. Motor Trade Association, [1937] A.C. 797 (H.L.) 275
CTN Cash and Carry Ltd. v. Gallaher, [1994] 4 All E.R. 714 278
Eadie v. Township of Brantford, [1967] S.C.R. 523 282

VI. RESTITUTION FOR WRONGS

1. Tortious Wrongs

Lamine v. Dorrell (1701), Ld. Ray. 1216 286
United Australia v. Barclays Bank, [1941] A.C. 1 (H.L.) 287

Phillips v. Homfray (1883), 24 Ch. D. 439 292
Strand Electric and Engineering v. Brisford Entertainments, [1952] 2 Q.B. 246 (C.A.) 296
Olwell v. Nye and Nissen, 173 P. 2d 652 (Wash. S.C., 1946) 301

2. Breaches of Fiduciary Obligation

Reading v. Attorney General, [1951] A.C. 507 (H.L.) 304
Attorney-General for Hong Kong v. Reid, [1994] 1 A.C. 324 (P.C.) 309

3. Breaches of Contract

British Motor Trade Association v. Gilbert, [1951] 2 All E.R. (641) Ch.D.) 318
New Orleans v. Firemen's Charitable Association, 9 SO. 486 (La S.C., 1891) 320
Adras Building Materials v. Harlow & Jones, February 11, 1988 (Supreme Court of Israel); [1995] Restitution Law Review 235 321
Attorney General v. Blake [2000] 4 All E.R. 385 (H.L.) 329